SUP25-0021

## TOLEDO - LUCAS COUNTY PLAN COMMISSIONS

One Government Center, Suite 1620, Toledo, OH 43604 P: 419 245-1200 F: 419 936-3730

DATE: August 15, 2025 REF: SUP25-0021

TO:

President Carrie Hartman and Members of Council, City of Toledo

FROM:

Toledo City Plan Commission, Lisa A. Cottrell, Secretary

SUBJECT:

Special Use Permit for a new Community Center at 2405 Stickney Avenue

The Toledo City Plan Commission considered the above-referenced request at its meeting on Thursday, August 14, 2025 at 2:00 P.M.

#### **GENERAL INFORMATION**

## Subject

Request - Special Use Permit for a new Community Center

Location - 2405 Stickney Avenue

Applicant - James Sherman

New Covenant Church of the Living God

2405 Stickney Avenue Toledo, OH 43608

Design Professional - Anthony Coronado

Midwest Church Design + Construction

634 Eckel Road Perrysburg, OH 43551

#### Site Description

Zoning - CR / Regional Commercial

Area -  $\pm 0.57$  acres

Frontage  $\pm 208.9$ ' along Sherman Street

±86.7' along Stickney Avenue

Existing Use - Vacant Commercial Structure

Proposed Use - Community Center

#### Area Description

North - RD6 / Moore Street, Single-Dwelling Homes, Duplex

Homes, Church

South - POS / Sherman Street, Forest Cemetery
East - POS / Stickney Avenue, Forest Cemetery

West - RD6 / Single-Dwelling Homes, Duplex Homes

August 15, 2025

Page 2

#### GENERAL INFORMATION (cont'd)

#### Parcel History

Z-124-45

Zone Change from C-D (Commercial) to D-E (Light Industrial) at Moore, Sherman, & Page Streets. (P.C. disapproved 9/20/45)

REF: SUP25-0021

## **Applicable Plans & Regulations**

- Toledo Municipal Code (TMC), Part Eleven: Planning and Zoning Code
- Forward Toledo Comprehensive Land Use Plan

#### STAFF ANALYSIS

The applicant is requesting a Special Use Permit for a new Community Center at 2405 Stickney Avenue. The site is approximately 0.57-acres and currently zoned Regional Commercial (CR). The applicant wishes to convert the existing vacant commercial structure on the site into a community center affiliated with the nearby New Covenant Church of the Living God. A Special Use Permit is required to operate a community center. To the north of the site is Moore Street, single-dwelling homes, duplex homes, and a church, to the south of the site is Sherman Street and Forest Cemetery, to the east is Stickney Avenue and Forest Cemetery, and to the west is more single-dwelling homes and duplex homes.

#### Parking, Loading and Access

Off-street parking is not currently provided on this site. The applicant is proposing a small parking lot with ten (10) parking spaces at the corner of Stickney Avenue and Moore Street. The Plan Director has determined that this is an acceptable number of parking spaces per TMC§1107.0600 Off-Street Parking Schedule "D". Due to the currently-proposed M-18-24, a Modification to TMC Chapter 11 – Zoning and Planning Code – Eliminating Parking Minimums, the applicant wishes to retain an option to not construct this proposed parking lot. If they wish to not construct the parking lot, they would be able to apply for a minor amendment to this special use permit to remove the parking portions of this approval.

TMC§1107.1700 requires one (1) of the proposed parking spaces to be van accessible in accordance with the Americans with Disabilities Act. This van-accessible space is shown; however, accessible parking must be located to provide the shortest path of travel to the building's accessible entrance. As such, the van-accessible space must be moved so that it is the closest parking space to the entrance. This requirement has been included as a condition of approval.

TMC§1107.0900 *Bicycle Parking* requires that this site provide two (2) bicycle parking spaces. These spaces have been shown and their location is acceptable as depicted. The proposed bicycle rack must be securely fixed to the ground and meet the standards of TMC§1107.0902.

TO: President Hartman and Members of Council August 15, 2025 Page 3

STAFF ANALYSIS (cont'd)

## Parking, Loading and Access (cont'd)

TMC§1107.1202 *Setbacks* requires the proposed parking lot to be set back at least fifteen feet (15') from Moore Street and Stickney Avenue. The parking lots are currently set back ten feet (10') from Moore St and Stickney Ave. This is discussed in more detail below.

REF: SUP25-0021

## Landscaping

TMC§1108.0202 Frontage Greenbelt requires a fifteen foot (15') wide frontage greenbelt along both Moore Street and Stickney Avenue. The site plan depicts ten foot (10') wide frontage greenbelts along Moore Street and Stickney Avenue. The proposed parking lot will need to be shifted five feet (5') south and five feet (5') west to accommodate the required fifteen foot (15') wide frontage greenbelt. This should not be difficult as there are grass areas with a minimum dimension of five feet (5') in both of these directions, although the proposed sidewalk on the southern end of the parking lot will become flush with the building. This has been included as a condition of approval.

TMC§1108.0202 Frontage Greenbelt also requires at least one (1) tree for every thirty feet (30') of frontage and a solid evergreen hedge planting within the Moore Street and Stickney Avenue frontage greenbelts. Sufficient evergreen screening has been provided; however, only one (1) new tree planting is proposed. An additional four (4) trees are required within the Moore Street greenbelt and two (2) trees are required within the Stickney Avenue greenbelt. The existing trees identified on the plan are within the right-of-way and – as stated in TMC§1108.0202(A) – may not be used towards frontage greenbelt requirements. The inclusion of these additional trees on a revised landscape plan has been included as a condition of approval.

Lastly for TMC§1108.0202 Frontage Greenbelt, stormwater treatment facilities may occupy up to fifty percent (50%) of the frontage greenbelt. The proposed stormwater treatment swale appears to occupy more than fifty percent (50%) of the Moore Street greenbelt. Staff believes the required increase in greenbelt width will bring the stormwater treatment swale's occupation of the greenbelt below fifty percent (50%). Even so, the assurance that the stormwater treatment swale occupies no more than fifty percent (50%) of the greenbelt has been included as a condition of approval.

TMC§1108.0204 Parking Lot Landscaping requires two (2) canopy trees and six (6) shrubs for every ten (10) parking spaces within parking lots. As such, two (2) canopy trees and six (6) shrubs are required for the parking lot's interior landscaping. The depiction of these additional trees on a revised landscape plan has been included as a condition of approval.

#### Design Standards

The applicant has proposed some changes to the existing building's façade. The building currently consists of primarily Exterior Insulation Finish System (EIFS) materials on façades visible from Sherman Street and Concrete Masonry Units (CMU) on other façades. Boarded-up

TO: President Hartman and Members of Council August 15, 2025 Page 4 STAFF ANALYSIS (cont'd)

## Design Standards (cont'd)

openings for windows are on most façades. Proposed changes include a two to three foot (2'-3') tall thin-brick veneer along the foundation of façades consisting of CMU and filling in some of the window openings with like material for that façade – whether EIFS or CMU. Window openings which are not filled with EIFS or CMU are proposed to be fitted with new windows.

REF: SUP25-0021

TMC§1109.0502 requires commercial/institutional structures to consist of at least eighty percent (80%) predominant materials and no more than twenty percent (20%) accent materials. The section defines EIFS and Architectural CMU as accent materials. Windows and brick are defined as predominant materials. Unfinished CMU is prohibited by the design standards. As this is an existing non-conforming building full compliance with the design standards of TMC§1109.0500 is not necessary; however, proposed work cannot increase the extent of the nonconformity. As such, no portion of any façade which was not previously an accent material may be filled with an accent material. This includes the filling of window holes and garage doors. Ideally all window holes would be fitted with windows; however, the applicant may choose to fill them in with any of the predominant materials listed in TMC§1109.0502. This has been included as a condition of approval.

TMC§1109.0502 requires commercial/institutional structures to have a predominant subtle, neutral, or earth-tone color, with accent colors permitted to take up only 20% of each façade. No colors are noted on the proposed elevation drawings; however, adherence to this requirement has been included as a condition of approval.

#### Signs

The applicant has shown three (3) signs/logos on the proposed elevations. It appears that the proposed signage may meet the requirements of TMC Chapter 1113 Signs; however, a review of the proposed signage was not conducted as a part of this Special Use Permit review. All signage must obtain a sign permit prior to installation. This has been listed as a condition of approval.

## Forward Toledo Comprehensive Land Use Plan

The Forward Toledo Comprehensive Land Use Plan identifies this site for Neighborhood Mixed-use (NM) land uses. The Neighborhood Mixed-Use land use designation preserves and promotes pedestrian-oriented commercial and mixed-use areas. These characteristics are a core component of neighborhoods and provide the highest density of commercial and housing opportunities. Individual parking lots for single commercial uses are discouraged. The proposed community center use is consistent with the Forward Toledo Plan as the community center seeks to be a core component of this neighborhood by offering a variety of community gatherings to bring positivity to the local community such as food pantry offerings, bible studies, and crafting classes. Additionally, the proposed development supports the following goals of Forward Toledo: Promote Recreational Opportunities, Encourage Social Opportunities, Building Preservation, and Strengthen Neighborhoods.

August 15, 2025

Page 5

STAFF ANALYSIS (cont'd)

Staff recommends approval of the requested Special Use Permit because the proposed use meets the stated purpose of the zoning code and is compatible with adjacent uses in terms of scale, site design, and operating characteristics. Additionally, staff recommends approval of the proposed community center because it is supported by multiple goals of the Forward Toledo Comprehensive Land Use Plan.

REF: SUP25-0021

#### PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION

The Toledo City Plan Commission recommends approval of SUP25-0021, a Special Use Permit for a new Community Center at 2405 Stickney Avenue, to the Toledo City Council, for the following three (3) reasons:

- 1. The proposed use meets the stated purpose of the Zoning Code and is consistent with the recommendations and goals of the Forward Toledo Comprehensive Land Use Plan (TMC§1111.0706(A));
- 2. The proposed use complies with all applicable provisions of the zoning code (TMC§1111.0706(B)); and
- 3. The proposed use is compatible with adjacent uses in terms of scale, site design, and operating characteristics (TMC§1111.0706(C)).

The Toledo City Plan Commission further makes the following recommendation to the Toledo City Council on the waver requested for SUP25-0021, a Special Use Permit for a new Community Center at 2405 Stickney Avenue:

#### **Chapter 1109 Design Standards**

#### Section 1109.0500 Building façade materials and color

Approve a waiver so that CMU, an accent material, may be used to infill a door and garage door on the north and northwest building elevations. This will match existing CMU which currently surrounds the doors. This waiver does not grant permission to fill in areas which were or are currently occupied by a window.

The Toledo City Plan Commission further recommends approval of SUP25-0021, a Special Use Permit for a new Community Center at 2405 Stickney Avenue, to the Toledo City Council, with the following **thirty-three (33)** conditions:

#### Bureau of Fire Prevention

1. It appears this building will undergo a change in level of activity. This will require compliance with all applicable Building, Fire, Electrical, Mechanical and Plumbing code requirements. (OBC105.1 & 101.4)

TO: President Hartman and Members of Council August 15, 2025

Page 6

## PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)

## Bureau of Fire Prevention (cont'd)

2. New and existing buildings shall be provided with approved address identification that meets Building & Fire Code requirements. (OBC 501.2 & OFC 505.1)

REF: SUP25-0021

3. A fire safety inspection is required prior to occupancy. (OFC 105.3.3.2 & TMC 1309.09)

#### Division of Transportation

- 4. Accessible parking must be the closest parking spot to the accessible building entrance to provide the shortest path of travel per ADA (Americans with Disabilities Act).
- 5. Existing driveway, approach and curb cut shall be removed on Moore Street and new cub and grass provided to match adjacent areas.

## **Division of Engineering Services**

- 6. All **proposed** sidewalk, drive approaches, curb, and pedestrian curb ramps within the public right-of-way shall be constructed in accordance with the City of Toledo Construction Standards, Specifications, Toledo Municipal Code, and Americans with Disabilities Act guidelines.
- 7. All proposed commercial drive approaches, (along with the sidewalk through the drive) shall be constructed with 8" thick concrete per City of Toledo Construction Standards and Specifications. No curb shall be permitted in the right-of-way along either side of a drive approach.
- 8. Required permits for all approved work in the public right-of-way shall be obtained, before work begins, from Ted Rousos, 419-245-1347. The application can be obtained online at Toledo.oh.gov search: Right of Way opening permit.
- 9. The stormwater planning is adequate for the site plan, but a full stormwater review for comments requires an engineering submittal of multiple items, listed as items 1.a. 1.g. on the SWP3 submittal coversheet provided to applicant's engineer. The cover sheet includes a web link to Toledo's 2014 Infrastructure Requirements document.
- 10. Following the stormwater review, additional items are needed to receive construction permission:
  - a. As listed on the SWP3 submittal cover sheet, items 2.a. 2.c.
  - b. Sewer fee and subcontracting for construction by a Toledo Licensed Sewer Contractor.
  - c. Project team shall provide advance copy of sample stormwater permit to bidders and with the contract for construction. It states conditions for precon notifications, field inspections, and permit closure.

August 15, 2025

Page 7

## PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)

#### Division of Engineering Services (cont'd)

11. Sanitary sewer service for this development is available subject to the Rules and Regulations of the Department of Public Utilities.

REF: SUP25-0021

#### Division of Environmental Services

- 12. Applicant shall maintain compliance with the City of Toledo's Stormwater regulations as specified in the Toledo Municipal Code. Special attention must be paid to all potential storm water impacts from the modification of the site, including but not limited to long-term operation and maintenance of existing structural and non-structural Best Management Practices.
- 13. Applicant shall maintain compliance with Ohio EPA's General Storm Water NPDES permit programs.
- 14. Applicant is strongly encouraged to install permanent inlet filters with oil absorbent pillow in parking lot catch basins to treat stormwater.
- 15. Applicant is strongly encouraged to include multiple green infra-structure measures to minimize runoff and increase infiltration, and to minimize the amount of new and/or additional impervious surface on the site.
- 16. Applicant is strongly encouraged to plant native, low maintenance and non-invasive trees, shrubs and perennials. Information is at <a href="https://ohiodnr.gov/wps/portal/gov/odnr/discover-and-learn/plants-trees/invasive-plants">https://ohiodnr.gov/wps/portal/gov/odnr/discover-and-learn/plants-trees/invasive-plants</a>; a list of invasive plants and alternative species can be downloaded from <a href="https://www.oipc.info/uploads/5/8/6/5/58652481/alternatives\_to\_ohio\_invasive\_plant\_species.pdf">https://www.oipc.info/uploads/5/8/6/5/58652481/alternatives\_to\_ohio\_invasive\_plant\_species.pdf</a>
- 17. Applicant shall maintain compliance with the City of Toledo and the State of Ohio's Air Quality Regulations applicable in the Toledo Municipal Code and the Ohio Administrative Code including, but not limited to the Asbestos and the Anti-Noise Laws.

## Plan Commission

- 18. Bicycle parking spaces shall meet the standards of TMC§1107.0902. Pole/rack details shall be submitted to the Planning Director.
- 19. Pursuant to TMC§§ 1107.1202 & 1108.0202 the proposed parking area shall be shifted to ensure a fifteen-foot (15') setback and frontage greenbelt on both Moore Street and Stickney Avenue. Not acceptable as depicted. A revised site and landscape plan shall be submitted to the Plan Director depicting the required parking lot setback.

August 15, 2025

Page 8

## PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)

#### Plan Commission (cont'd)

20. Pursuant to TMC§1108.0202 the frontage greenbelts along Moore Street and Stickney Avenue require at least one (1) tree for every thirty feet (30') of frontage. Not acceptable as depicted. A revised landscape plan shall be submitted to the Plan Director depicting a minimum of four (4) trees within the Moore Street greenbelt and two (2) trees within the Stickney Avenue greenbelt.

REF: SUP25-0021

- 21. Pursuant to TMC§1108.0202 stormwater treatment facilities may occupy up to fifty percent (50%) of each frontage greenbelt. Not acceptable as depicted. A revised landscape plan shall be submitted to the Plan Director depicting the stormwater treatment facilities less than fifty percent (50%) of each frontage greenbelt.
- 22. Pursuant to TMC§1108.0204 two (2) canopy trees and six (6) shrubs are required within parking lots for every ten (10) parking spaces. Not acceptable as depicted. A revised landscaping plan shall be submitted to the Plan Director depicting a minimum of two (2) trees and six (6) shrubs within or immediately adjacent to the proposed parking lot.
- 23. Topsoil must be back filled to provide positive drainage of the landscape area.
- 24. Landscaped areas may not contain bare soil, aggregated stone or decorative rock. Any ground area must be covered with hardwood mulch, grass or other vegetative ground coverage.
- 25. The location, number, height, diameter and species of any materials to be planted and maintained shall be depicted on a detailed 'final' landscape plan, as well as the location and number of any existing trees to be retained. Trees, shrubs, and landscape materials shall meet the standards included in TMC§ 1108.0400 Landscape Materials Standards. Not acceptable as depicted. A revised landscape plan shall be submitted to the Plan Director depicting the height, diameter, and species of any proposed or existing trees, shrubs, or plant material.
- 26. Proposed modifications to the existing structure may not increase its level of nonconformity with TMC§1109.0500, except as waived. Not acceptable as depicted. Revised elevations shall be submitted to the Plan Director depicting no portion of any façade which was not previously an accent material being replaced/filled with an accent material, except as waived.
- 27. Proposed color changes to the existing structure shall remain in compliance with the building color requirements of TMC§1109.0500.
- 28. Applicant shall obtain appropriate permits for any proposed signage, subject to TMC§1113 *Signs*.

August 15, 2025

Page 9

## PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)

#### Plan Commission (cont'd)

29. Lights and light fixtures must be selected and arranged to direct and reflect the light away from any adjacent residential property and public ways and away from the sky above the light fixture per TMC§1107.1908.

REF: SUP25-0021

- 30. The Special Use Permit may be reviewed for compliance with the conditions of approval, negative secondary effects, and adherence to all requirements of the Toledo Municipal Code. If outstanding issues are found and not addressed the Special Use Permit may be considered for revocation.
- 31. Approval of the Special Use Permit will lapse after one (1) year if the criteria listed in TMC§1111.0707 have not been met.
- 32. Minor adjustments to the site plan that do not violate the above conditions, or the Toledo Municipal Code, may be reviewed and approved by the Director of the Toledo City Plan Commission.
- 33. No permits shall be issued until arrangements satisfactory to the Director of the City of Toledo Plan Commission have been made for compliance with the conditions as set forth above.

Respectfully Submitted, A Usa Called

Lisa A. Cottrell

Secretary

AS

Five (5) sketches follow

New Covenant Church of the Living God, 2405 Stickney Avenue, Toledo, OH 43608 Cc: Midwest Church Design + Construction, 634 Eckel Road, Perrysburg, OH 43551 Alex Schultz, Planner

# **GENERAL LOCATION**

SUP25-0021 ID 5





## **ZONING & LAND USE**

SUP25-0021 ID 5









