



## TOLEDO - LUCAS COUNTY PLAN COMMISSIONS

One Government Center, Suite 1620, Toledo, OH 43604 P: 419 245-1200 F: 419 936-3730

DATE: August 24, 2021

REF: SPR-33-21

TO: President Matt Cherry and Members of Council, City of Toledo

FROM: Toledo City Plan Commission, Thomas C. Gibbons, Secretary

SUBJECT: Major Site Plan Review for a new multi-family development at 2011 Franklin, 18 W. Woodruff, 23, 27, & 29 Irving.

The Toledo City Plan Commission considered the above-referenced request at its meeting on Thursday, August 12, 2021 at 2:00 P.M. The Plan Commission approved the application; the Women of the Old West End, INC (WOWE) appealed this decision on August 23, 2021.

### GENERAL INFORMATION

#### Subject

Request	-	Major Site Plan Review for new multi-family development
Location	-	2011 Franklin, 18 W. Woodruff, 23, 27 & 29 Irving
Applicant	-	Ryan Cassell Community Housing Network 1680 Watermark Drive Columbus, OH 43215
Owner	-	Warren A.M.E. Church Housing Opportunities 915 Collingwood Blvd Toledo OH 43604
Engineer	-	Lewandowski Engineers 234 N. Erie Street Toledo, OH 43604
Architect	-	Andrew Wieland Ghafari + Associates 17101 Michigan Avenue Dearborn, MI 48126

**GENERAL INFORMATION (cont'd)**

Site Description

Zoning	-	RM34 Multi-family residential
Area	-	±2.18 Acres
Frontage	-	±265' along Franklin Ave
	-	±360' along W Woodruff Ave
	-	±360' along W Irving St
Existing Use	-	Undeveloped Land
Proposed Use	-	Multi-Family Dwelling

Area Description

North	-	Apartments, Single Family Homes, Church / RM36
East	-	Multi-family Homes / RD6
South	-	Lodge / RS6 & CR-SO
West	-	Undeveloped land, vehicle storage and offices / IG

Parcel History

V-186-65	-	Vacation of a portion of Warren Street between Irving Street and Woodruff Avenue (PC approved 08/05/1965).
V-187-65	-	Vacation of alleys adjacent to Warren School Site bounded by Putnam St, Irving St, Franklin Ave and woodruff Ave (PC approved 08/16/1965, Ord. 800-65).
V-244-68	-	Vacation of alley between Woodruff Avenue and Irving Street west of Franklin Avenue (PC approved 09/05/1968, Ord. 947-68).
Z-209-82	-	Zone Change to Multi-dwelling Residential for an area bounded by Bancroft St, Fulton St, and Woodruff Ave (PC approved 10/05/1982, CC approved 12/1/1982, Ord. 44-83).
SPR-46-16	-	Major Site Plan Review for Multiple Bldgs. On a Lot and Community Center at 2011 Franklin Ave, 18 W. Woodruff Ave, 23-29 Irving St, 2015 Warren Ave, 129 Irving St (case expired).

**GENERAL INFORMATION (cont'd)**

Parcel History

- |              |   |   |
|--------------|---|---|
| SUP-10009-16 | - | Special Use Permit for Active Community Recreation at 2011 Franklin Ave, 18 W. Woodruff Ave, 23-29 Irving St, 2015 Warren Ave, 129 Irving St, 128-136 W. Woodruff Ave, & 2012 Putnam St (case expired).           |
| SPR-40-18    | - | Major Site Plan Review for 65 Unite Apartment Building at 2011 Franklin, 18, 128, 132, 136 W Woodruff, 23, 27, 29, 129 Irving, 2015 Warren & 2012 Putnam St (case expired).                                       |
| SUP-11005-18 | - | Special Use Permit for Job Training Facility at 2011 Franklin, 18, 128, 132, 136 W. Woodruff, 23, 27, 29, 129 Irving, 2015 Warren & 2012 Putnam St (case expired).  |
| SPR-55-19    | - | Major Site Plan Review for a multi-dwelling residential development at 2011 Franklin Avenue, 18, 128, 132 & 136 W. Woodruff Ave, 23 27, 29, & 129 Irving St, 2015 Warren St (PC approved 01/09/20, case expired). |

Applicable Plans and Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code, Part Eleven: Planning and Zoning Code
- Toledo 20/20 Comprehensive Plan
- Warren Sherman Area Council Strategic Plan (1996)

## **STAFF ANALYSIS**

The applicant, Community Housing Network Inc (CHN) is requesting a Major Site Plan Review for a new multi-family development at 2011 Franklin, 18 W. Woodruff, 23, 27 & 29 Irving. The site will be a three (3) story, forty-six (46) unit apartment building. Surrounding land uses include apartments, single family homes, and a church to the north, multi-family houses to the east, a lodge and commercial properties to the south, and an undeveloped lot followed by offices to the west.

The site is the location of the former Warren Elementary School, which closed in 2006 and has since been demolished and sold to the current owner. The eastern  $\pm 2.18$  Acres of the block are included in this plan. The submitted site plan proposes a roughly 'L' shaped building at the corner of Franklin Avenue and Irving Street, extending down almost the entire frontage of Franklin Ave. The site plan shows twenty-three (23) parking spaces. A Major Site Plan Review is required because of the building size.

The applicant describes the project as “permanent, affordable, supportive housing” for the formerly homeless. Tenants have the same rights and responsibilities as residents in other apartment buildings as set forth in all relevant Landlord/Tenant Laws and Fair Housing regulations. This project is not a shelter, group or transitional home, or substance treatment center. Based on the number of units requested this project is considered a multi-family dwelling.

Similar developments have been proposed for the site. However, a variety of challenges such as neighborhood concerns, and funding complications caused previous applications to expire or be withdrawn. Most recently, SPR-55-19 was reviewed and approved in 2020 however was not completed and approval expired prior to the project moving forward. The newly submitted site plan and elevations differ from all previous submissions.

### **Parking and Circulation**

The site plan depicts an off-street parking area on the southern portion of the site. A new driveway would be created off of W. Woodruff to allow egress and ingress of the parking area. The parking area contains twenty-three (23) total spaces. Three (3) of which would be van acceptable.

Due to the proposed multi-family use of the site, TMC§1107.0305 Off-Street Parking Schedule “A” applies. Parking requirements for Multi-Dwelling structures are calculated cumulatively based on the number of units in the dwelling. For the forty-six (46) unit building seventy-four (74) parking spaces would be required. The twenty-three (23) parking spaces shown does not meet this minimum, however an alternative parking plan has been submitted and approved by the Director.

**STAFF ANALYSIS (cont'd)**

Parking and Circulation (cont'd)

In the alternative parking plan, the applicant states that the number of spaces is based on the needs of their tenants, who often cannot afford vehicles. Details regarding the study can be found in Exhibit “A”. In order to provide parking for guests the site plan offers one (1) parking space for every two (2) units. Based on the evidence provided the Director has approved the quantity of parking. An undeveloped portion of the site shall be retained in the event of future parking demand or conversion of the apartments into market-rate units.

A portion of the total number of required off-street parking spaces must be specifically designated, located, and reserved for use by persons with physical disabilities. According to the table in TMC§1107.1701 – *Number of Required Parking Spaces for Persons with Disabilities*, the applicant is required to provide at least two (2) auto and one (1) van accessible space for a total of three (3) parking spaces for persons with physical disabilities. Two (2) van accessible parking spaces and one (1) auto accessible space are depicted and comply with these parking requirements.

Additionally, bicycle parking slots shall be provided pursuant to Off-Street Parking Schedule “A” (TMC§1107.0900). Off-Street Parking Schedule “A” requires one (1) bicycle parking slot per ten (10) parking spaces. Calculations conclude that a total of seven (7) bicycle parking slots are required for the development. The submitted site plan depicts ten (10) bicycle parking spaces, as well as an unspecified quantity of inside bicycle storage. Pedestrian flow has been accommodated via walkways branching from the public sidewalk.

Lastly, per TMC§1107.1910, parking areas may be required to provide litter receptacles. The site plan depicts a dumpster on the western edge of the site, however does not clarify the location of any litter receptacles, such as trash cans, for use of parking area users as well as others. A revised site plan indicating at least one (1) trash can near the building entrance closest to the parking area shall be required as a condition of approval.

Landscaping

Per TMC§1108.0202 – *Frontage Greenbelts* the site is required to provide a fifteen-foot (15') landscaped frontage greenbelt. The submitted landscape plan is acceptable as submitted. A variety of trees already existing on the site are being preserved and have been evaluated using the existing tree credit table found in TMC§1108.0407(B). Any existing trees removed shown in the frontage area during construction shall be required to be replaced with the equivalent quantity of new plantings. The parking lot screening requirements are met by the solid evergreen hedge around the perimeter of the parking lot.

## **STAFF ANALYSIS (cont'd)**

### Landscaping (cont'd)

Per TMC§1108.0205 Interior Site Landscaping one (1) tree per five hundred square feet (500') of building coverage is required. Frontage greenbelt trees are included in this calculation. Foundation plantings for elevations visible from the right-of-way are required as well. Thirty-six (36) total trees are required. Using the frontage greenbelt trees this requirement has been met, however the landscape plan indicates an additional twenty-four (24) trees across the site exceeding the minimum requirements. The quantity of trees provided will have a significant impact on mitigating the urban-heat island effect associated with the additions on the lot.

Additionally, landscaping around the parking area is required per TMC§1108.02.04 Parking Lot Landscaping. Twenty square feet (20') of landscaped area is required per parking and stacking space. Landscape areas within the parking area must be peninsular or island types and must be constructed in such a way as to prevent damage to landscaped areas. Perimeter landscaping must be installed along any parking lot area adjacent to a street, place, or driveway, or visible from an immediately adjacent property. Two (2) trees are required for each ten (10) parking spaces within the parking lot. Six (6) shrubs are required per ten (10) parking spaces as well. The two landscaped interior islands depicted on the site plan as well as the perimeter plantings meet all requirements of this code.

### Building Design & Materials

All elevations of the proposed building are visible from the right-of-way and are required to comply to the standards of TMC§1109.0500 Building Façade Materials and Colors. Submitted elevations depict a minimum of sixty percent (60%) brown brick to be used on each elevation. Additional materials include less than twenty percent (20%) gray and beige vinyl, minimal accents of metal, and ample glazing. All elevations meet the façade requirements.

Additionally, each building plane has utilized recesses, offsets, and a variety of roof heights to better incorporate into the surrounding context. Entry ways have been clearly defined using distinct accenting and canopy covers. Overall, the building elevation and design complies with TMC design standards.

### Neighborhood Meeting

Pursuant to TMC§1111.0200 *Neighborhood Meetings*, prior to the Plan Commission public hearings the Plan Director can require a neighborhood meeting be held by the applicant to clarify development plans and create an opportunity for additional public input. Due to the scale and history of the site a neighborhood meeting was held on Monday, July 26 2021 at 2001 Ashland Ave from 5:00 pm to 6:30 pm. Neighbors of the site, as well as the district councilmember, were in attendance.

## **STAFF ANALYSIS (cont'd)**

### Warren Sherman Area Council Strategic Plan

The Warren Sherman Area Council Strategic Plan designates the site institutional in 1996, prior to the demolition Warren School. Although the proposed land use does not conform to the plan, staff is supportive of the proposed use due to the stated objective of developing housing to meet the needs of low income individuals in the Warren Sherman area.

### Toledo 20/20 Comprehensive Plan

The Toledo 20/20 Comprehensive Plan targets this site as Park & Open Space. The Park & Open Space land use designation is intended to preserve and enhance major open space and recreation area. The park & Open Space designation may also be applied to privately-owned open space areas within residential developments.

The Toledo 20/20 Comprehensive Plan land use designation was assigned to this property when it functioned as an elementary school. Although the proposed land use does not conform to the Toledo 20/20 Comprehensive Plan, staff is supportive of the proposed use due to the Multi-Family Residential and Urban Village land use designations being immediately adjacent to the site.

Staff recommends approval of the Major Site Plan Review. The proposed land use is compatible with the surrounding uses and permitted within the zoning district. The site complies with the standards and intent of the zoning code.

## **PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION**

The Toledo City Plan Commission approved SPR-33-21, a Major Site Plan Review for new multi-family development at 2011 Franklin, 18 W. Woodruff, 23, 27 & 29 Irving:

1. The proposed site plan complies with all standards of the Toledo Municipal Code and the Zoning Code (**TMC§1111.0809(A)**); and,
2. The proposed land use is allowed in the zoning district which it is located (**TMC§1111.0809(B)**),

Toledo City Plan Commission approved SPR-33-21, a request for Major Site Plan Review for new multi-family development at 2011 Franklin, 18 W. Woodruff, 23, 27 & 29 Irving, subject to the following **forty-seven (47)** conditions:

The following conditions are listed by agency of origin. Applicants are encouraged to contact each of the agencies to address compliance with their conditions.

## PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)

### Division of Engineering

1. A pre-submittal meeting is not required; however, one may be requested. Contact information is as follows:

Division of Engineering Services: ph. 419-245-1315, fax 419-936-2850

Right-of-Way and Inspection: Joe Warnka 419-245-1341

Roadway: Tim Grosjean 419-245-1344

Water: Andrea Kroma 419-936-2163

Stormwater Drainage: Lorie Haslinger 419-245-3221; Andy Stepnick 419-245-1338

Sanitary Sewers: Mike Elling 419-936-2276

2. All **proposed** sidewalk, drive approaches, curb, and pedestrian curb ramps within the public right-of-way shall be constructed in accordance with the City of Toledo Construction Standards, Specifications, Toledo Municipal Code, and Americans with Disabilities Act guidelines.
3. All commercial drive approaches, (along with the sidewalk through the drive) shall be constructed with 8" thick concrete per City of Toledo Construction Standards and Specifications. No curb shall be permitted in the right-of-way along either side of a drive approach. **No horizontal curb cutting will be permitted to create a curb drop/opening.** Existing drive approaches, including the curb drop, that will no longer be utilized shall be removed and restored with curb to match the adjacent curb.
4. Required permits for all approved work in the public right-of-way shall be obtained, before work begins, from One Stop Shop, (419) 245-1220.
5. Contact Joe Warnka at (419) 245-1341 for inspection of above mentioned items.
6. Water service is available subject to the Rules and Regulations of the Department of Public Utilities.



**PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)**

Division of Engineering (cont'd)

7. The plans show the proposed water service line connecting to an 8-inch diameter water main in Woodruff Avenue. This 8-inch water main is no longer in service. Contact the Division of Engineering Services for information regarding the existing water facilities in Woodruff Avenue and Franklin Avenue.
8. Detailed plans for the water service lines shall be submitted to the Division of Water Distribution for review and approval. Plan design and submittal shall comply with the current version of the City of Toledo DPU Infrastructure Design and Construction Requirements.
9. The current version of "WATER GENERAL NOTES FOR CITY OF TOLEDO PRIVATE WATER MAINS, FIRE LINES AND LARGE SERVICES" shall be included on the plans and can be obtained from the City of Toledo Division of Water Distribution.
10. The water meter setting detail, including meter bypass (if applicable) and backflow preventer, shall be submitted to the City of Toledo Backflow Prevention Coordinator, 401 S. Erie Street, Toledo, OH 43602 for review and approval. Approval of site utility plan is contingent on approval of meter setting and backflow preventer.
11. All commercial properties are required to have approved backflow protection devices installed on the domestic water service and fire protection lines. Installation of the devices must be verified by the Division of Water Distribution and all devices must be registered with BSIonlinetracking.com @ 800-414-4990. Contact the Division of Water Distribution (419-936-2839) to verify the backflow prevention requirements for this site.
12. Contact the City of Toledo Fire Prevention Bureau (419-245-1263) to verify the fire protection requirements for this site. Contractors performing work on new or existing fire systems shall be licensed by the State of Ohio Fire Marshall and certified by the City of Toledo Fire & Rescue Department.
13. New water service taps will be installed by City of Toledo at the developer's expense.
14. No stormwater objection to site plan. Submittals needed to initiate stormwater review are:
  - Engineering drawings and calculations compliant with the City of Toledo Infrastructure Design and Construction Requirements, which is available at <https://cdn.toledo.oh.gov/uploads/documents/Public-Utilities/Engineering-Services/2014-infrastructure-requirements.pdf>.

**PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)**

Division of Engineering (cont'd)

- A Storm Water Pollution Prevention Plan (SWP3) including a completed Ohio EPA SWP3 checklist.
  - Long term operations and maintenance (O&M) plan for Detention and Post-Construction BMP's, to the requirements of the Ohio CGP, as a standalone 8.5x11 document.
15. Following the review process, the following will be needed for final stormwater approval:
- Fee for the sewer construction permit, which also requires a sewer contractor, licensed with the City of Toledo, to be named for the project.
  - Completed form for responsible parties for SWP3 implementation.
  - Covenant for the approved O&M plan, utilizing the City's standard agreement language that references O&M Plan as Exhibit B.
16. At the time of approval of stormwater plans, the applicant will likely be eligible for a percent reduction in the property's stormwater utility fee through the Stormwater Credit Program. Information on the application process can be found at <https://toledo.oh.gov/business/environment/storm-water-program>
17. Sanitary sewer service for this development is available subject to the Rules and Regulations of the Department of Public Utilities.
18. A single sanitary sewer tap from this site shall be allowed into the public sanitary sewer system. Developer shall use existing sanitary tap, when available.
19. Any previous kills that were not done at the right-of-way line shall be re-killed at the right-of-way to eliminate any active pipes on the property.

Sewer and Drainage Services

20. S&DS requires that all existing private sewer lines that are not being removed or properly abandoned (both storm & sanitary) be cleaned and inspected.
21. S&DS required that the existing private sanitary lines (after they have been cleaned) that are not being removed or properly abandoned be televised from the building (or private cleanout) to where they connect with the public sewer system if this has not been done in the past two (2) years. An electronic copy (DVD/memory stick) shall be provided to S&DS demonstrating the lines cleaning and integrity.

**PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)**

Division of Environmental Services

22. Applicant shall maintain compliance with the City of Toledo's Storm Water regulations as specified in the Toledo Municipal Code. Special attention must be paid to all potential storm water impacts from the modification of the site, including but not limited to long-term operation and maintenance of existing structural and non-structural Best Management Practices.
  - a. Notification shall be made to the Division of Environmental Services (419-936-3015) no later than three days prior to commencement of construction activities.
  - b. Construction BMPs shall be in place prior to the start of construction activities.
  - c. SWP3 inspection reports shall be kept on site with the SWP3 and readily accessible during normal working hours.
23. Applicant shall maintain compliance with Ohio EPA's General Storm Water NPDES permit programs.
24. Applicant is strongly encouraged to include multiple green infra-structure measures to minimize runoff and increase infiltration, and to minimize the amount of new and/or additional impervious surface on the site.
25. Applicant is strongly encouraged to plant native, low maintenance and non-invasive trees, shrubs and perennials.  
[http://ohiodnr.gov/portals/0/pdfs/invasives/Alternatives to Ohio Invasive Plant Species.pdf](http://ohiodnr.gov/portals/0/pdfs/invasives/Alternatives%20to%20Ohio%20Invasive%20Plant%20Species.pdf)
26. Applicant shall maintain compliance with the City of Toledo and the State of Ohio's Air Quality Regulations applicable in the Toledo Municipal Code and the Ohio Administrative Code including, but not limited to the Asbestos and the Anti-Noise Laws.

Fire Prevention

27. The proposed new building will require compliance with all applicable Fire Sprinkler and Alarm, Building, Electrical, Mechanical and Plumbing code requirements.
28. Post Indicator Valve (PIV) and Fire Dept. Connection (FDC) locations to be approved by the site engineer and the Fire Prevention Dept.
29. Approved Premises identification is required.

Division of Transportation

30. Wheel stops may be required at the discretion of the Division of Transportation and Planning Director at parking spots abutting property lines, sidewalk, planting strips, and buildings per TMC 1107.1907.

## PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)

### Plan Commission

31. All lots included in the development shall be combined into a single parcel.
32. All spaces reserved for the use by persons with physical disabilities shall adhere to the standards outlined in TMC§1107.1700. **Acceptable as depicted.**
33. Per TMC§1107.0900 three (3) bicycle parking spaces are required. **Acceptable as depicted.**
34. Per TMC§1107.1202(A)(1), no parking space may be located within the front yard (25') of a residential district, except parking spaces for detached houses, attached houses, and duplexes may be located on the driveway. **The site plan depicts the parking area starting further than twenty-five (25') back and is acceptable as depicted.**
35. Per TMC§1107.1407, the Planning Director may authorize a reduction in the number of required off-street parking spaces for development that provides an alternative parking plan. **Revision needed to alternate parking plan. The director approves of the shown quantity of parking. A revised site plan shall depict a portion of the lot that shall be retained in the event of future parking demand on the site or in the event the apartments are converted into market-rate units.**
36. Off-street parking and loading spaces, parking lots, maneuvering areas, aisles and driveways must be surfaced with concrete, bituminous asphalt, or other dust-free material other than gravel or loose fill, and be graded to drain all surface water towards the interior of the parking lot.
37. Dumpster location(s) shall be clearly defined, have a concrete pad and be surrounded by a solid wooden fence or a masonry screen enclosure with landscaping and shall not be located in any required setback. **A revised site plan shall indicate material of dumpster enclosure, the location is acceptable as depicted.**
38. A minimum of one litter receptacle shall be provided for the parking area of the building near the entrance to the building and accessible via an ADA path. **A revised site plan shall indicate location of litter receptacle.**

## PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)

### Plan Commission (cont'd)

39. The building design shall meet the requirements of TMC§1109.0500 Building Façade Materials and Color. All façades are visible from the right of way and therefore must comply to these standards. **Acceptable as depicted.**
40. The façade colors shall be low-reflectance, subtle, neutral, or earth tone colors. Building trim and accent areas may feature brighter colors, including primary colors subject to the approval of the Planning Director. **Acceptable as depicted.**
41. No free-standing signs greater than forty-two inches (42”) from grade are permitted – any proposed signage must meet the requirements of low-profile signs per Toledo Municipal Code Title Nine – Sign Code.
42. A detailed site, lighting, fencing and four (4) copies of a landscaping plan (separate from building & site plans) shall be submitted to the Plan Director for review and approval. Such plan shall include:
  - a. A fifteen-foot (15’) greenbelt is required along each frontage, and shall include one (1) tree per every thirty feet (30’) of frontage. The portions of the site with a parking lot facing right-of-way shall include a solid evergreen hedge planting to screen the parking lot so that no headlights of any vehicles can be seen from the public street; **acceptable as depicted.**
  - b. All parking areas visible from the right-of-way or adjacent properties shall be screened from view using an evergreen hedge line so that no headlights of any vehicles can be seen; **acceptable as depicted.**
  - c. The total interior landscaping required in parking lots is twenty (20) square feet per parking and stacking space; **acceptable as depicted.**
  - d. Landscape areas within the parking area must be peninsular or island types and must be constructed with six-inch (6”) by eighteen-inch (18”) concrete curbing, cast-in-place, extruded, or by some other process approved by the Planning Director;
  - e. All parking spaces must be within 100 linear feet of a landscaped area; **acceptable as depicted,**
  - f. Topsoil must be back filled to provide positive drainage of the landscape area;

## PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)

### Plan Commission (cont'd)

- g. Landscaped areas may not contain bare soil, aggregated stone or decorative rock. Any ground area must be covered with hardwood mulch, grass or other vegetative ground coverage;
  - h. The location, number, height, diameter and species of any materials to be planted and maintained, as well as the location and number of any existing trees to be retained;
  - i. The location, height and materials for any fencing to be installed and maintained; Pursuant to TMC§1105.0302(A)(1), fences may not exceed 3½ feet in height in the required front setback.
  - j. Six (6) shrubs are required to be installed in interior landscape areas for each ten (10) parking spaces within the parking lot. One canopy tree may substitute for three shrubs. **Not acceptable as depicted. European Cranberry Bush shall be replaced with non-invasive alternative.**
  - k. If site is ½ acre or larger, landscaped areas must be irrigated as necessary to maintain required plant materials in good and healthy condition. Irrigation plans must be submitted with development plans and must contain all construction details;
  - l. The location and direction of any proposed lighting (lights are to be directed away from adjacent residential properties); and,
  - m. The location, lighting and size of any signs.
  - n. One (1) tree is required per five-hundred (500) square feet of building coverage. **Acceptable as depicted.**
43. Per TMC§1108.0407(B), if any preserved tree dies it must be replaced with another tree or trees that are at least equal to the credit value of the preserved tree.
- a. Along Franklin nine (9) tree credits are required; two thirty-six-inch (36") caliper trees and one twenty-four-inch (24") caliper tree provide the equivalent of twenty-two (22) tree credits. Along Irving twelve (12) tree credits are required. Eight (8) existing trees are shown worth a cumulative of forty-eight (48) tree credits. Along Woodruff twelve (12) tree credits are required. Five (5) new trees, as well as twelve (12) existing tree credits bring the frontage into compliance.

**PLAN COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION (cont'd)**

Plan Commission (cont'd)

44. Prior to any site demolition, or grading, barriers must be constructed around existing trees and shrubs to be preserved. Barriers around trees to be preserved must include the area under the drip line of the tree. Barriers around shrubs to be preserved must include the area within three-feet (3') of the shrub mass. Failure to maintain barriers may result in revocation of the building permit. All protections shall comply to the standards of TMC§1108.0408 Protection During Construction.
45. Minor adjustments to the Site Plan that do not violate the above conditions, or the Toledo Municipal Code, may be reviewed and approved by the Director of the Toledo City Plan Commission.
46. Per TMC§1111.0814, if a building permit is not issued within two (2) years of this approval then the site plan approval shall become null and void.
47. No permits shall be issued until arrangements satisfactory to the Director of the City of Toledo Plan Commission have been made for compliance with the conditions as set forth above.

Respectfully Submitted,

Thomas C. Gibbons  
Secretary

JGL

Seven (7) sketches follow

One (1) Exhibit follows

CC: Ryan Cassell, Community Housing Network, 1680 Watermark Drive, Columbus, OH 43215  
Engineering Services  
Sewer & Drainage  
Environmental Services  
Transportation  
Fire Prevention  
Lisa Cottrell, Administrator  
Jonny Latsko, Planner