CITY OF TOLEDO, OHIO

2021 Disparity Study



ABOUT GRIFFIN & STRONG, P.C.

Firm Specializes in disparity research, contract compliance, program development, training & supplier diversity consulting:



The most qualified team in the industry:

- 4 Juris Doctors
- 2 PhD Economists
- PhD Anthropologist
- <u>All</u> with expertise in disparity research.



No study conducted by Griffin & Strong, P.C. has <u>ever</u> been challenged or overturned in court.



IN GOOD HANDS

Project Executive, Rodney K. Strong has unmatched expertise, serving as Director of the City of Atlanta's Department of Contract Compliance and as principal architect of the City of Atlanta's distinguished MBE contracting program.

Principal Researcher, Dr. Vince Eagan is one of the **foremost experts** nationwide, conducting **over 120 studies** & successfully defending **6** studies as expert witness.



PROJECT APPROACH



WHAT IS A DISPARITY STUDY?

A disparity study is an objective research tool that determines whether a governmental agency has actively or passively discriminated against certain groups due to their race or gender.

Discrimination, which may be the current affects of past discrimination, is determined through quantitative (statistical) and qualitative (anecdotal) evidence, as well as an examination of current policies and procedures. The findings of the disparity study will result in recommendations by the study team to remedy any discrimination or disparities found. The recommendations, if accepted, are intended to be implemented as policy.

WHY DO WE DO DISPARITY STUDIES?

Disparity Studies Form the Factual Basis for Remedial Programs

City of Richmond v. J.A. Croson Co., 488 U.S. 469 (1989) & Adarand Constructors, Inc. v. Pena. 515 U.S. 200 (1995)

- Strict Scrutiny for race and gender-based programs
- (Intermediaté for gender-based programs)
- Must have a factual predicate
- Methodology dictated by Case Law
- Must have narrowly-tailored remedy (to avoid over- or underinclusion)





OUR PROCESS

PRIVATE SECTOR ANALYSIS

Determines whether race, ethnicity or gender status has affected the utilization of firms owned by members of these groups in both the public and private sector; includes evaluation of disparities in:

- Self-employment disparities
- Building permit data
- Construction market disparities
- Credit markets

The Private Sector can utilize the City's availability data to identify firms for outreach and solicitation.



Informational Meeting

 Designed to bring awareness to study and educate on study process

Anecdotal Interviews

 Thirty (30) in- depth 1 on 1 interviews with business owners for the study

Survey of Business Owners

 Telephone Survey to gather both quantitative and qualitative feedback

Public Hearings

• Two (2) strategically placed engagements across the state to gather **public testimony** on record

Focus Group

• Two (2) Small group meetings by business owners selected by random sample

Organizational Meetings

 We will identify and engage all relevant stakeholders (including Civic, Social and Industry Groups)

Email/Social Media Comments & Dedicated Website

• Ensures that **everyone** has an opportunity to be heard

Formal Complaints

 Review of formal complaints in the form of bid protests, or other administrative or legal proceedings

VIRTUAL COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

PROJECT DELIVERABLES

GSPC's program development, management, and implementation expertise sets us apart.

Findings & Recommendations

- Summarized with Executive Summary
- Review of Efficacy and Identification of Race/Gender Neutral and Race/Gender Conscious remedies
- Recommendations informed by findings of the study and tied to findings to guide narrow tailoring (no generic recommendations)
- Both Best Practices and Innovative Approaches for Race/Gender Neutral or Race/Gender Conscious Remedies.

PROJECT TIMELINE

Notice to Proceed – December 1, 2020

Draft Report – November 19, 2021

Final Report – December 20, 2021

Presentation – January 31, 2022

Survey of

Business Owners

Summer, 2021

Preparation of

Databases

Anecdotal Evidence

<u>Fall, 2021</u>

Private Sector Analysis

Statistical Disparity Analysis.

Study Findings/ Recommendations

Draft Study
Report/Final Study
Report and

Presentation

Winter 2021

Study Findings/

Recommendations

Draft Study
Report/Final Study
Report and
Presentation

Winter, 2020

Data Assessment

Legal Review

Informational Meetings

Data Collection

Spring, 2021

Policies and

Procedures

Review

Launch Website



WE CAN HELP YOU

Specifically based on the Study Findings, we can help you to:

- Develop solid policies to implement effective program elements
- Provide tools for MWDBEs to bid as prime contractors
- Improve data systems
- Give you useable data
- Advise you on the nuances of operating remedial programs
- Distinguish non-discrimination policy from preference programs
- Advise you on develop partnerships with local anchor institutions and consolidate with other programs



STRATEGIES TO PROMOTE EQUITABLE COMMUNITY ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT





