# REF: SPR-14-24 DATE: June 13, 2024

# **GENERAL INFORMATION**

<u>Subject</u>

Req	uest	-	Appeal of Conditions of Approval for Minor Site Plan Review for new building and parking lot	
Loc	ation	-	726 N Westwood Avenue	
Арр	olicant/Owner	-	Savannah Marten Pregnancy Center of Greater Toledo 716 N Westwood Avenue Toledo, OH 43607	
Arc	hitect	-	Ray Micham The Collaborative One Seagate Park, Level 118 Toledo, OH 43604	
Civ	il Engineer	-	Dave Kuhn Feller, Finch & Associates, Inc. 1683 Woodlands Drive Maumee, OH 43537	
Site Description				
Exis	-	- - -	CO / Office Commercial ±1.375 Acres ±173.70' along N Westwood Avenue Undeveloped land Day care and offices	
Area Description				
Nor Sou		-	Warehouse / IL Pregnancy Center of Greater Toledo and funeral home / CO	
East Wes	-	-	Cellular tower facility, warehouse / IL Westwood Avenue, truck repair, single-family residence, offices / IL	

### GENERAL INFORMATION (cont'd)

Parcel History				
T-52-23	-	Lot split for 0.179 acres of land combined with existing 1.196 acres, creating a 1.375 acre parcel (Administratively approved on 5/6/24).		
Z-2004-21	-	Zone change from IL Limited Industrial to CO Office Commercial (PC approved 4/8/21; CC approved 5/25/21 via ORD. 289-21).		
T-28-04	-	Lot split for 1.196 acres of land (Administratively approved 4/2/04).		
T-29-00	-	Lot split for 2.9508 acres of land with remainder of 2.3919 acres of land (Administratively approved 9/20/00).		
Z-43-80	-	Zone change from M-1 Restricted Industry to C-2 Restricted Office (Deferred indefinitely).		

#### Applicable Plans and Regulations

- Toledo Municipal Code, Part Eleven: Planning and Zoning Code
- Toledo 20/20 Comprehensive Plan

#### **STAFF ANALYSIS**

The applicant is requesting an Appeal of Conditions of Approval for Minor Site Plan Review for a new building and parking lot at 762 Westwood Avenue. The 1.375 acre site is zoned CO Office Commercial and is currently undeveloped. The project includes the construction of an approximately 14,334 square foot building and associated parking. The applicant also owns the property and building to the south of the subject property. The project will include extending the existing parking lot and shared parking and access drives for the two properties. The proposed building is intended to be used for offices, education/meeting rooms, and a day care.

The Minor Site Plan Review was approved by Plan Commission staff on May 7, 2024 subject to thirty-nine (39) conditions. The applicant is requesting appeal of four (4) conditions: #24, #32e, #34 and #35c outlined in the administrative approval letter of the Minor Site Plan Review for a new building and parking lot at 726 N Westwood Avenue. The full conditions of approval are included as Exhibit "A" at the end of this report.

### **STAFF ANALYSIS** (cont'd)

Pursuant to TMC§1111.0810(A), appeals of the Planning Director's decision on a Minor Site Plan Review application may be taken to the Plan Commission by filing a notice of appeal with the Planning Director. Appeals must be filed within 10 days of the Planning Director's decision. Public notice of appeals shall be provided by posted and mailed notice in accordance with TMC§1111.0300. The applicant requested the appeal to the following four conditions of approval within ten (10) business days in order to be reviewed at the Plan Commission hearing.

- <u>Condition #24:</u> Maximum front setback for buildings in the CO Office Commercial Zoning District is 35 feet. The proposed building is located 97'1" from the street rightof-way. Not acceptable as depicted. A BZA waiver shall be secured, or the site redesigned to comply with this requirement.
- Condition #32e: Per TMC§1108.0203 a Type "B landscape buffer is required along the north and east property lines as the subject property is zoned CO and the abutting property is IL. The buffer is required to be a minimum of ten-feet (10') in width with four (4) canopy trees and fifteen (15) shrubs per 100 linear feet. An opaque fence, wall or berm may be used and can substitute for the shrub requirements. The north property line is 347 feet which equals 14 required trees and 53 required shrubs. The east property line is 171.56 feet which requires seven (7) trees and 26 shrubs. The landscape plan does not depict a landscape buffer along the north or east property lines. Not acceptable as depicted. A Type B landscape buffer shall be provided along the north and east property lines.
- <u>Condition #34:</u> Per 1109.0205(C.3) transparent windows shall occupy at least 40 percent of the area between two and ten feet at grade from the base of the primary elevation facing the right-of-way. Not acceptable as depicted. The west elevation, which faces the Westwood right-of-way, will need to be designed to meet this requirement.
- Condition #35c: The north, south and west elevations of the proposed building are visible from the Westwood Avenue right-of-way. These elevations are required to consist of a minimum of 80 percent of a predominant building material and no more than 20 percent of an accent material. The proposed elevations consist mainly of fiber cement siding, which is considered an accent material. Not acceptable as submitted. Revised elevations shall be required depicting no more than 20 percent fiber cement siding, or any other accent material.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Toledo City Plan Commission take the following action on the requested waivers:

 Waiver request from maximum front setback for buildings in the CO Office Commercial Zoning District per TMC§1106.0102 to allow for the proposed building to be constructed ±97'1" from the street right-of-way.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION** (cont'd)

Take no action on this waiver as the Plan Commission does not have authority to waive setback requirements. The authority to do so is granted to the Board of Zoning Appeals (BZA). The applicant will need to apply to the BZA for relief from this condition. Staff is in support of the waiver as the setback is consistent with the existing development to the south. This will allow the applicant to expand the existing parking lot and share parking and access drives thereby providing safe, efficient and convenient movement of traffic within the site and on adjacent roadways.

• Waiver request from providing a Type "B landscape buffer along the north and east property lines per TMC§1108.0203. The waiver is requested as the required maximum setback will impose a hardship on the project as it has been designed with the parking drive aisle at the property line in accordance with no side setback. There is not enough space on the site to relocate the building without encroaching on the required fire separation.

Approve the waiver to not require a Type "B" landscape buffer along the north and east property lines and in lieu of the buffer a six foot high privacy fence shall be installed.

Waiver request from providing transparent windows that occupy at least 40 percent of the area between two and ten feet at grade from the base of the primary elevation facing the right-of-way per TMC§1109.0205(C.3). The glazing reduction to ±23 percent is requested because the interior ceilings are 8 foot above the finish floor and several building components, including the elevator and exit stairs, are located along the front façade. Placement of transparent windows where these building components are would limit the value of this requirement.

Approve the waiver to reduce the required percentage of transparent windows to  $\pm 23$  percent because the structure is intended to look like a house, not a commercial storefront and the intended use is a day care.

Waiver to allow an accent material, fiber cement siding, to consist of more than 20 percent of the north, south and west elevations of the proposed building that are visible from the Westwood Avenue right-of-way (TMC§1109.0500). The building material waiver is requested because the proposed building is meant to look like a home. The building will be occupied by the organization "Mom's House". Many families find comfort in the distinctly residential look of the existing Mom's house facility (also sided in fiber cement).

Approve the waiver to allow the use of fiber cement siding as a predominant material since the surrounding zoning and land uses are predominantly industrial in nature, and the material standards are not applied to industrial zoned properties. In addition, the structure is intended to look like a house and the intended use is a day care.

REF: SPR-14-24. . . June 13, 2024

APPEAL OF CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL MINOR SITE PLAN REVIEW TOLEDO CITY PLAN COMMISSION REF: SPR-14-24 DATE: June 13, 2024 TIME: 2:00 P.M.

LK Five (5) sketches and One (1) Exhibit follow



12 - 6









# Exhibit "A" Conditions of Approval

#### **Division of Engineering Services**

- 1. All **proposed** sidewalk, drive approaches, curb, and pedestrian curb ramps within the public right-of-way shall be constructed in accordance with the City of Toledo Construction Standards, Specifications, Toledo Municipal Code, and Americans with Disabilities Act guidelines.
- 2. All commercial drive approaches, (along with the sidewalk through the drive) shall be constructed with 8" think concrete per City of Toledo Construction Standards and Specifications. No curb shall be permitted in the right-of-way along either side of a drive approach. No horizontal curb cutting will be permitted to create a curd drop/opening. Existing drive approaches, including the curb drop, that will no longer be utilized shall be removed and restored with curb to match the adjacent curb.
- 3. Required permits for all approved work in the public right-of-way shall be obtained, before work begins, from Ted Rousos, 419-245-1347. The application can be obtained online at Toledo.oh.gov search: Right of Way opening permit.
- 4. A tap into the existing 16-inch diameter water main in N Westwood Avenue will be permitted, if desired, on this project.
- 5. Refer to comments provided by the Division of Water Distribution regarding the proposed private water mains and/or service lines.
- 6. An easement is required for the proposed new storm drainage line to be constructed through the adjacent southerly property.
- 7. The city received confirmation from the SPR applicant's design team that the proposed new storm outfall to Williams Ditch has received Army Corps nationwide permit coverage. A Flood Hazard Zone Development permit from Toledo is also required. Application is to Toledo's Floodplain Administrator via the Building Inspection Department.
- 8. The city received an accompanying engineering design which shows substantial completion of stormwater design work. Also received is the SWP3 coversheet and its accompanying items for a complete stormwater submittal. The plans are substantially in conformance with the City's 2014 Infrastructure Requirements. Stormwater review is underway; minor revisions may be needed. Following the stormwater review, additional items are needed for construction permit(s):
  - a. Any remaining items on the SWP3 submittal coversheet.
  - b. Fee and a Toledo Licensed Sewer Contractor for the sewer construction permit.

### Division of Engineering Services (cont'd)

- c. Construction inspection and completion of obligations in the stormwater permit.
- 9. Sanitary sewer service for this development is available subject to the Rules and Regulations of the Department of Public Utilities.
- 10. A single sanitary sewer tap from this site shall be allowed into the public sanitary sewer system. Developer shall use existing sanitary tap, when available.

### Division Sewer & Drainage Services

- 11. S&DS requires that all existing private sewer lines that are not being removed or properly abandoned (both storm & sanitary) be cleaned and inspected.
- 12. S&DS requires that the existing private sanitary lines (after they have been cleaned) that are not being removed or properly abandoned be televised from the building (or private cleanout) to where they connect with the public sewer system if this has not been done in the past (2) two years. An electronic copy (DVD/memory stick) shall be provided to S&DS demonstrating the lines cleaning and integrity.

#### **Division of Environmental Services**

- 13. Applicant shall maintain compliance with the City of Toledo's Storm Water regulations as specified in the Toledo Municipal Code. Special attention must be paid to all potential storm water impacts from the modification of the site, including but not limited to long-term operation and maintenance of existing structural and non-structural Best Management Practices.
  - a. Notification shall be made to the Division of Environmental Services (419-936-3015) no later than three days prior to commencement of construction activities.
  - b. Construction BMPs shall be in place prior to the start of construction activities.
  - c. SWP3 inspection reports shall be kept on site with the SWP3 and readily accessible during normal working hours.
- 14. Applicant shall maintain compliance with Ohio EPA's General Storm Water NPDES permit programs.
- 15. Applicant is strongly encouraged to include multiple green infrastructure measures to minimize runoff and increase infiltration, and to minimize amount of new and/or additional impervious surface on site.

### Division of Environmental Services (cont'd)

- 16. Applicant is strongly encouraged to plant native, low maintenance and non-invasive trees, shrubs and perennials. Information is at <a href="https://ohiodnr.gov/wps/portal/gov/odnr/discover-and-learn/plants-trees/invasive-plants">https://ohiodnr.gov/wps/portal/gov/odnr/discover-and-learn/plants-trees/invasive-plants</a>; a list of invasive plants and alternative species can be downloaded from <a href="https://www.oipc.info/uploads/5/8/6/5/58652481/alternatives\_to\_ohio\_invasive\_plant\_species.pdf">https://www.oipc.info/uploads/5/8/6/5/58652481/alternatives\_to\_ohio\_invasive\_plant\_species.pdf</a>.
- 17. Applicant shall maintain compliance with the City of Toledo and the State of Ohio's Air Quality Regulations applicable in the Toledo Municipal Code and the Ohio Administrative Code including, but not limited to the Asbestos and the Anti-Noise Laws.

### Fire Prevention Bureau

- 18. The proposed new building will require compliance with all applicable Fire Sprinkler and Alarm, Building, Electrical, Mechanical and Plumbing code requirements.
- 19. Approved Premises identification is required. Key box(s) for access to buildings and areas restricted by fences, gates, ect...
- 20. Key box(s) for access to buildings and areas restricted by fences, gates, ect...

#### **Division of Traffic Management**

- 21. Sidewalk is required along Westwood Avenue per TMC1107.1300.
- 22. Traffic Management requests sidewalk from new right-of-way sidewalk to business sidewalk.
- 23. If one does not already exist, a cross access agreement is required with adjacent owner to the South.

#### Plan Commission

- 24. Maximum front setback for buildings in the CO Office Commercial Zoning District is 35 feet. The proposed building is located 97'1" from the street right-of-way. Not acceptable as depicted. A BZA waiver shall be secured, or the site redesigned to comply with this requirement.
- 25. Per TMC§1104.0703(D), thirty-five (35) square feet of useable indoor space per person in care must be regularly available for the day care operation. The site plan notes 48 children, which equates to 1,680 square feet of usable indoor space required for the day care. Per the site plan the day care will occupy 4,700 square feet in the building. Acceptable as noted. A floor plan needs to be submitted to document the required useable indoor space for the day care.

### Plan Commission (cont'd)

- 26. Per TMC§1104.0703(E), sixty (60) square feet of useable outdoor space must be provided for each person in care using the outdoor area at any one time. The site plan depicts 2,880 square feet of outdoor space in the rear of the proposed building. Acceptable as depicted.
- 27. A paved off-street area for dropping off and picking up persons in care at the facility must be provided and approved by the Division of Transportation per TMC§1104.0703(F). Acceptable as depicted.
- 28. Parking shall adhere to the to the requirements of TMC§1107.0304 Parking Schedule "A". Day Care Centers must have one (1) space per six (6) person capacity or one (1) space per 400 square feet of building area, whichever is greater. In addition, office uses require one (1) space per 300 square feet of building area. The site plan notes that 4,700 square feet in the building is for the day care and 9,634 square feet for office uses. This equates to 12 spaces for the day care and 33 spaces for office uses. The existing building on the lot to the south requires 22 spaces for office uses as it is 6,500 square feet in area. Therefore, a total of 67 parking spaces are required. The site plan depicts a total of 62 spaces for both parcels. Not acceptable as submitted. An Alternative Access and Parking Plan will need to be submitted if the minimum required parking spaces are not provided.
- 29. Per TMC§1107.0304, the Off-Street Parking Schedule requires one bicycle parking slot per 10 parking spaces for both day care and office uses. Based on the 62 parking spaces provided, seven (7) bicycle parking slots are required. The site plan illustrates eight (8) bicycle slots. Acceptable as depicted.
- 30. Per TMC§1107.1701, the applicant is required to provide two (2) car accessible parking spaces and one (1) van accessible parking space based on 62 parking spaces provided. Two car accessible and four van accessible parking spaces are provided. Acceptable as depicted.
- 31. Per TMC§1107.1907 whenever a parking lot extends to a property line, sidewalk, planting strip, or building, a wheel stop device consisting of a concrete stop, a permanent concrete curb, an expanded sidewalk or other suitable restraint as approved by the Planning Director must be installed. Acceptable as depicted.
- 32. A detailed site, lighting, sign, fencing and three (3) copies of a landscaping plan (separate from building & site plans) shall be submitted to the Plan Director for review and approval. Such plan shall include:
  - a. A Type "B" landscape buffer is required around the outdoor area for the day care that is a minimum of ten-feet (10') in width, and has four (4) canopy trees and fifteen (15) shrubs per 100 linear feet. An opaque fence, wall or berm may be used and can substitute for the shrub requirements. The total perimeter of the play area is 153.33 feet which requires seven (7) trees and 23 shrubs. The site plan

### Plan Commission (cont'd)

- b. depicts a 48 inch high chain-link fence. Not acceptable as depicted. A Type B landscape buffer shall be provided around the outdoor play area.
- c. A minimum 15-foot-wide frontage greenbelt along public right-of-ways is required that contains at least one tree for every 30 feet of frontage per TMC§1108.0202. The 302.40 feet of frontage along Westwood Avenue requires 10 trees. The landscape plan depicts a greenbelt in excess of 15 feet wide with eight (8) trees. Not acceptable as depicted. Two additional trees shall be provided along Westwood Avenue, for a of total 10 required trees for the frontage greenbelt.
- d. Per TMC§1108.0202 if a parking lot is proposed in the front of the property, the frontage greenbelt shall include a solid evergreen hedge planting to screen the parking lot from the public street. The landscape plan depicts a solid hedge of evergreen shrubs as required. Acceptable as depicted.
- e. Per TMC§1108.0203 a Type "B" landscape buffer is required along the north and east property lines as the subject property is zoned CO and the abutting property is IL. The buffer is required to be a minimum of ten-feet (10') in width with four (4) canopy trees and fifteen (15) shrubs per 100 linear feet. An opaque fence, wall or berm may be used and can substitute for the shrub requirements. The north property line is 347 feet which equals 14 required trees and 53 required shrubs. The east property line is 171.56 feet which requires seven (7) trees and 26 shrubs. The landscape plan does not depict a landscape buffer along the north or east property lines. Not acceptable as depicted. A Type B landscape buffer shall be provided along the north and east property lines.
- f. Per TMC§1108.0204 the total interior landscaping required in parking lots is 20 square feet per parking and stacking space. Two (2) canopy trees and six (6) shrubs are required to be installed in interior landscape areas for each 10 parking spaces within the parking lot. With 62 parking spaces proposed, 13 canopy trees and 38 shrubs are required. The submitted landscape plan depicts parking islands with five (5) canopy trees and 38 shrubs. The required shrubs are provided; however, an additional eight (8) canopy trees are required. Not acceptable as depicted. The additional eight (8) canopy trees shall be provided for a total of 13 canopy trees and 38 shrubs for interior parking lot landscaping.
- g. Interior site landscaping is required for commercial properties, in addition to other landscape requirements, per TMC§1108.0205. This includes: one (1) 2-inch caliper tree for every 1,000 square feet of building coverage, foundation plantings along all portion of the building that is visible from a public right-of-way, and landscaping at major building entrances. Foundation plantings and landscaping at major building entrances are provided; however, eight (8) trees are required based

### Plan Commission (cont'd)

on the noted building floor are of 7,167 square feet. Not acceptable as depicted. The required eight (8) trees for interior site landscaping shall be provided.

- h. Topsoil must be back filled to provide positive drainage of the landscape area.
- i. Landscaped areas may not contain bare soil, aggregated stone or decorative rock. Any ground area must be covered with hardwood mulch, grass or other vegetative ground coverage.
- j. The location, number, height, diameter and species of any materials to be planted and maintained, as well as the location and number of any existing trees to be retained.
- k. The site is ½ acre or larger, so landscaped areas must be irrigated as necessary to maintain required plant materials in good and healthy condition. Irrigation plans must be submitted with development plans and must contain all construction details;
- 1. The location and direction of any proposed lighting (lights are to be directed away from adjacent residential properties); and,
- m. The location, lighting and size of any signs.
- 33. Per 1109.0204(A) at least one main entrance of any commercial building shall face and open directly onto a 5 foot wide connecting walkway to the street sidewalk without requiring pedestrians to walk around buildings or around parking lot outlines which are not aligned to a logical route. Not acceptable as depicted. A connecting sidewalk shall be constructed from the sidewalk required by Transportation is Condition #21.
- 34. Per 1109.0205(C.3) transparent windows shall occupy at least 40 percent of the area between two and ten feet at grade from the base of the primary elevation facing the right-of-way. Not acceptable as depicted. The west elevation, which faces the Westwood right-of-way, will need to be designed to meet this requirement.
- 35. Per TMC§1109.0500 the elevations of the proposed building are subject to building material and color standards. Building material standards apply to all facades that are visible from the right-of-way. Building color standards apply to all exterior elevations regardless of right-of-way visibility. At least 80 percent of each elevation shall be comprised of predominant building materials and colors; and up to 20 percent of each elevation may be comprised of accent building materials and colors.
  - a. The percentage of proposed building materials on the submitted elevations includes roofing materials. Roofing material is not used in the calculation of percentages of

### <u>Plan Commission</u> (cont'd)

- b. building façade materials. Not acceptable as depicted. Remove this item and provide revised building materials percentages for each elevation.
- c. The north, south and west elevations of the proposed building are visible from the Westwood Avenue right-of-way. These elevations are required to consist of a minimum of 80 percent of a predominant building material and no more than 20 percent of an accent material. The proposed elevations consist mainly of fiber cement siding, which is considered an accent material. Not acceptable as submitted. Revised elevations shall be required depicting no more than 20 percent fiber cement siding, or any other accent material.
- d. The color for the all building elements needs to be provided. Not acceptable as depicted.
- 36. No new free-standing signs greater than forty-two (42) inches from grade are permitted any proposed signage must meet the requirements of Toledo Municipal Code Title Nine Sign Code.
- 37. Minor adjustments to the Site Plan that do not violate the above conditions, or the Toledo Municipal Code, may be reviewed and approved by the Director of the Toledo City Plan Commission.
- 38. No permits shall be issued until arrangements satisfactory to the Director of the City of Toledo Plan Commission have been made for compliance with the conditions as set forth above.
- 39. Per TMC§1111.0814, if a building permit is not issued within two (2) years of this approval then the site plan approval shall become null and void.